Event: 4th JMC Meeting of the Kolarctic CBC 2014–2020 Programme
Date: 07.–08.12.2017
Location: Scandic Ishavshotel, Fredrik Langesgate 2, Tromsø, Norway
Language: The meeting was held in English

PARTICIPANTS OF THE MEETING
Thursday 07.12.2017

Members and Deputy Members
Norway
Arve Skjerpen, the Chairman, Ministry of Local Government and Modernisation
Remi Strand, Finnmark County Council
Irene Dahl, Troms County Council
Stephanie Bjørø, Ministry of Foreign Affairs

Finland
Tuulia Väliheikki, Ministry of Economic Affairs and Employment
Hilkka Halonen, Regional Council of Lapland
Leena Ruokanen, Lapland Centre for Economic Development, Transport and the Environment
Timo Rautajoki, Lapland Chamber of Commerce
Jari Koivumaa, Trade Union Confederation AKAVA for Professional and Managerial Staff in Finland, regional office of Lapland

Russia
Anna Popova, Ministry of Economic Development
Igor Kapyrin, Ministry of Foreign Affairs
Ilya Ostapchuk, Murmansk Region
Anna Fofanova, Arkhangelsk Region
Sergey Kungurtsev, Nenets Autonomous District

Sweden
Kristian Lindvall, Ministry for Foreign Affairs
Johan Antti, County Administrative Board of Norrbotten
Glenn Berggård, Region Norrbotten
Peter Waara, Norrbotten Association of Local Authorities

Other participants
Svetlana Bibichkova, Ministry of Economic Development
Lena Karnovich, European Commission, EU Delegation to Russia
Iveta Puzo, TESIM
Odd Ståle Dalsåen, Observer RAG Norway
Päivi Ekdahl, Regional Council of Lapland
Jan Martin Solstad, Vadsø Branch Office
Linda Mosand, Vadsø Branch Office
Kairi Pääsuke, Luleå Branch Office
Julia Korshunova, Murmansk Branch Office
Marina Pirogovskaya, Arkhangelsk Branch Office
Riikka Oittinen, Managing Authority
Marjaana Lahdenranta, Managing Authority
Renata Musifullina, Managing Authority
Katri Niska-Honkonen, Managing Authority
Mari Lämså, Managing Authority
Marja-Riitta Lukkari, secretary of the meeting, Managing Authority
MINUTES OF THE MEETING  
Thursday 07.12.2017

1. Opening of the meeting, approval of the agenda of the meeting
The Chairman of the JMC Mr. Arve Skjerpen opened the meeting at 14:00. The updated list of JMC members and deputy members (Annex 1) and the meeting agenda were presented.

Decision:
Participants of the meeting were notified and the quorum was established. Notification on the changes in the list of JMC members and deputy members were noted (Annex 1). Declaration of impartiality and confidentiality was handed out. Meeting agenda was approved.

2. State of Play of the Kolarctic CBC 2014–2020 Programme
Ms. Anna Popova (Deputy Head of Department for Development and Regulation of External Economic Activities, Mineconomy Russia) gave an overview of the ratification process of the Financial Agreement in Russian Duma. According to current information, the estimated time of ratification in the Russian Duma will be in March-April 2018.

Ms. Katri Niska-Honkonen (Financial Manager, MA) gave presentation (PP1) on the designation of the Managing Authority and the Description of the Management and Control system.

Ms. Riikka Oittinen (Programme Manager, MA) gave an overview on status of contracting of projects from the first call for proposals. The Grant contract negotiations are estimated to be finished by the end of March 2018, and the Grant contracts are ready to be signed after the Financial Agreement between Russian and European Commission is been ratified in the Russian Duma and the designation of the MA has been done in the European Commission.

Ms. Riikka Oittinen (Programme Manager, MA) gave presentation (PP2) on the participation in the annual CBC conference in Tallinn.

Ms. Kairi Pääsuke (Senior Advisor, BO Sweden), Mr. Jan M Solstad (Programme Coordinator BO Norway), Ms. Julia Korshunova (Head of Russian BO) gave an overview of Branch offices’ work: the experience gained in the info seminars and consultations arranged during the 2nd Call for Proposals, comments from RAG meetings and the start-up of the Branch Office in Arkhangelsk. The JMC discussed about the comments given by RAGs and the difference between the points given to the applications by RAGs.

Ms. Iveta Puzo (Tesim) gave a presentation (PP3) on the planned trainings and activities of Tesim during the year 2018.

New personnel in Branch Offices and Managing Authority were introduced to the JMC: Coordinator of the Arkhangelsk Branch Office Ms. Marina Pirogovskaya and Financial Officer Ms. Mari Lämsä.

Decision:
Presentations and information were noted by the JMC.
3. **Approval of the Large Infrastructure Project full applications**

European Commission approved in its internal consultation following three LIP summaries in April 2017

- General furnishing and surface infrastructure development of the Kola-Vehnetulomsky-BDP Lotta Road (KO3000)
- Reconstruction of the road Kaamanen-Kirkenes (KO3001)
- Raja-Jooseppi; BCP development and reconstruction; traffic arrangements, building and technology (KO3002).

Joint Monitoring committee was informed of this in its meeting in June 2017 and Managing Authority was delegated to ask proposed LIP projects to submit the Full Application. The deadline for applications was 31.10.2017 and all three applications were received by the set deadline.

After receiving the Full Application, the MA has verified the applications general correspondence to the Project Summaries as well as their formal eligibility requirements. The Managing Authority used the administrative and eligibility checklist which was approved by JMC in June 2017. Ms. Päivi Ekdahl gave an overview on the administrative check of the full applications. Annexes 2, 3, 4 contain the summary of each project, administrative checklist and the full application. All the clarifications that were required during the administrative check has been delivered to the MA by the Lead Partners.

Ms. Katri Niska-Honkonen gave an overview on the programme financing. The amount of funding available from EU+Russia+Finland is 14,8 million euro and from Norway 1 million euro. Total available programme funding is 15,8 million euro.

**Decision:**

The Joint Monitoring Committee approves the Full Applications of the projects KO3000, KO3001 and KO3002. The project KO3002 was approved under two conditions. 1. The Lead Partner has to submit a signed confirmation that it is able to implement the project in full also in case full financing cannot be received from the programme funds but it should be collected by increasing Partner’s own contribution. Gap between the applied and existing financing is about 2,9 million euro, which at least partly can be covered by increasing Finland State co-financing to the programme 2) The signed Partnership Agreement of the Ministry of Transport of Russia will be submitted to the Managing Authority. The two conditions must be met before the Managing Authority submits the Full Application to the European Commission.

The MA will submit the Full Application with its annexes to the European Commission by the end of 2017 and the EC shall check the admissibility of the project. After receiving the approval from the EC the MA starts the preparation of the Grant Contract together with the Lead Partner of the Project.

4. **Decision on the approval or rejection of the standard projects applications submitted during the 2nd Call for Proposals of the Kolarctic CBC Programme 26.06.–29.09.2017**

The application material has been available to the members of JMC in PROMAS system and it has also been delivered with the meeting material. Annex 5 Summary of applications, Annex 6 list of RAG scores and Annex 7 Evaluation grid 2nd Call for Proposals has been sent to the member of JMC 16.11.2017.
Ms. Marja-Riitta Lukkari (CBC-coordinator, MA) gave a presentation (PP4) on the results of the 2nd Call for Proposals. Ms. Riikka Oittinen asked the JMC to note, that the MA will automatically check the budgets of approved projects during the Grant contract negotiations. In situations where the JMC wants to diminish the budget of individual applications in its meeting, the MA would appreciate if the JMC would be more specific on that how much the diminishing should be, either in euros or as a percentage, and from which post the diminishing should be taken.

The JMC discussed about the participation of the SMEs’ in the 2nd Call, and on basic issues and procedures concerning the decisions to be made.

Peter Waara had conflict of interest on projects KO2051, KO2088, KO2099 and KO2139 and therefore he left the meeting room and did not participate in conversation and decision making of those projects.

**Decision:**
The JMC agreed that they will discuss the applications starting with the projects that have scored more than the average 76,72 points.

Following 6 projects were approved:
- KO2011 Arctic Railway Infrastructure in Kolarctic II, Northern Research Institute Narvik in the condition that the role fo the Finnish Traffic Agency is included in the project implementation
- KO2020 Barents On Time, Finnmark County Authority
- KO2093 Phenomena of Arctic Nature, Metsähallitus, Parks & Wildlife Finland
- KO2100 Ice Operations, Northern Research Institute Narvik
- KO2071 Development of common approaches to involvement youth into science and technical sphere, Municipality of Alta
- KO2072 Kolarctic Food Refining CBC Project, NordConsult Oy. Project was approved with recommendation to diminish the budget by taking into account RAG comments during Grant Contracts negotiation phase.

Following project was rejected because the JMC did not find consensus about funding the project:
- KO2139 Attractive Arctic. Results were unclear and the logical framework was not clearly defined in the application.

Following project was rejected, but the JMC recommended the partners to participate in the next Call of Proposals:
- KO2012 Arctic Sea Tourism. The application got relatively high scores in the RAG evaluation but did not get national co-financing from Norway. The JMC wants to encourage the partners to come up with an updated application in the next call for proposals.

Following projects that had high total scores from the RAGs were rejected because of the lack of Norwegian national co-financing:
- KO2017 Development of the Barents Sea geoportal to support blue growth and sustainable use of marine resources
- KO2035 e-Learning and Cultural Knowledge Technology
- KO2101 Arctic Food Tourism Experiences.

Following project was rejected:
- KO2051 Arctic Connect – Barents. In the 1st Call for Proposals JMC recommended to the applicants to submit updated application in the 2nd Call of Proposals. The application was considered not improved in the 2nd Call of Proposals in terms of
involvement of federal level partners on the Russian side. The project activities may need some state permissions, which may not be obtained within the project period. Sustainability of the project result is not clear, as the idea of the project needs to be developed and financed further, after the implementation of the project. Resources for the further development and financing are not clear.

The Russian and Finnish delegations pointed out the need to address why some applications with high scores from the RAG evaluations do not seem to succeed in getting Norwegian national co-financing. The situation needs to be analyzed, because rejecting several high-quality application only because of a lack of Norwegian national co-financing is not in accordance with the spirit of the program and not fair to the partners from the other countries. The Finnish delegation questioned the fact that Norwegian co-financing seemed to be more available for applications with Norwegian LPs than for applications with Norwegian partners only. The applying process of Kolarctic funding is time consuming for the partners and the assessment process for the applications involve many high-qualified representatives from the four countries. To avoid a similar situation in the future, the chairperson asked the JMC to reflect and consider for the next call for proposal to demand that each project partner sign a Partnership Declaration, including the commitment of co-financing, and submit it to the MA together with the application form.

*Meeting for 7th December 2017 was closed at 18:40.*
PARTICIPANTS OF THE MEETING
Friday 08.12.2017

Members and Deputy Members
Norway
Arve Skjerpen, the Chairman, Ministry of Local Government and Modernisation
Remi Strand, Finnmark County Council
Irene Dahl, Troms County Council
Stephanie Bjøro, Ministry of Foreign Affairs

Finland
Tuulia Väliheikki, Ministry of Economic Affairs and Employment
Hilkka Halonen, Regional Council of Lapland
Leena Ruokanen, Lapland Centre for Economic Development, Transport and the Environment
Timo Rautajoki, Lapland Chamber of Commerce (left the meeting at 12:40)
Jari Koivumaa, Trade Union Confederation AKAVA for Professional and Managerial Staff in Finland, regional office of Lapland

Russia
Anna Popova, Ministry of Economic Development
Igor Kapyrin, Ministry of Foreign Affairs
Ilya Ostapchuk, Murmansk Region
Anna Fofanova, Arkhangelsk Region
Sergey Kungurtsev, Nenets Autonomous District

Sweden
Kristian Lindvall, Ministry for Foreign Affairs
Johan Antti, County Administrative Board of Norrbotten (left the meeting at 12:40)
Glenn Berggård, Region Norrbotten (left the meeting at 12:40)
Peter Waara, Norrbotten Association of Local Authorities (left the meeting at 12:40)

Other participants
Svetlana Bibichkova, Ministry of Economic Development
Lena Karnovich, European Comission, EU Delegation to Russia
Iveta Puzo, TESIM
Odd Ståle Dalsåen, Observer RAG Norway
Päivi Ekdahl, Regional Council of Lapland
Jan Martin Solstad, Vadsø Branch Office
Linda Mosand, Vadsø Branch Office
Kairi Pääsuke, Luleå Branch Office
Julia Korshunova, Murmansk Branch Office
Marina Pirogovskaya, Arkhangelsk Branch Office
Riikka Oittinen, Managing Authority
Marjaana Lahdenranta, Managing Authority
Renata Musifullina, Managing Authority
Katri Niska-Honkonen, Managing Authority
Mari Lämsä, Managing Authority
Marja-Riitta Lukkari, secretary of the meeting, Managing Authority
MINUTES OF THE MEETING  
Friday 08.12.2017

The Chairman of the JMC Arve Skjerpen opened the meeting at 9:00 am. Participants of the meeting were notified and the quorum was established. The JMC continues to decide on approval and rejection of the applications on the Agenda point 4.

4. Decision on the approval or rejection of the standard projects applications submitted during the 2nd Call for Proposals of the Kolarctic CBC Programme 26.06.–29.09.2017

The JMC continued to decide on approval and rejection of the applications on the Agenda point 4.

Decision:
The JMC decided to regard three applications that had scored less than the average but had complied the requirements of the exclusive sub-sections of the Evaluation Grid.

Following project was approved to be financed:
• KO2124 Reindeer Meat – Quality High.

Following projects were rejected:
• KO2162 Indigenous Business in the Arctic- Diversification and Innovation of Indigenous Economy because of low total points and lack of the right partners on the Russian side
• KO2099 Craft Calotte – Craft tourism & Craft entrepreneurship because of low total points and because the applied programme financing exceeded the available remaining funding for the 2nd Call.

The JMC rejected the following projects because of the low total points and because they did not comply with the requirements of the exclusive sub-sections of the Evaluation Grid:
• KO2003 Art Bus North 2019
• KO2013 Sustaining safety in the Arctic by proper and compatible protective equipment in the head region
• KO2041 CULTURAL CODE KEYS OF BARENTS ECONOMY-2
• KO2042 Arctic Connections and Circular Economy in Large Scale Bioindustry/Forest Industry
• KO2088 Logistics for Business from Sea-to-Sea
• KO2092 Beyond the Arctic Roads
• KO2120 Oil transport in the Northern regions
• KO2133 Development of nature based tourism activities.

Following projects were rejected, but the JMC recommended the partners to participate in the next Call of Proposals:
• KO2022 Innovative off-grid power supply system for Arctic conditions using combined fossil–renewable energy generation–ARCCinnopsys. Note from the MA in the Annex 5 about lack of infrastructure financing was corrected after checking from the EC during the meeting. The JMC wants to encourage the partners to come up with an updated project proposal with strengthened partnership and better described cross-border impact in the next call for proposals.
• KO2031 Arctic Safety Bridge: Advanced Rescue Management Across Borders. The JMC wants to encourage the partners to come up with an updated project proposal that is taking into account the comments from the RAGs in the next call for proposals.
Lunch break 12:40–13:30
During the lunch break, the JMC members Mr. Timo Rautajoki, Mr. Johan Antti, Mr. Glenn Berggård and Mr. Peter Waara left the meeting.

5. State of play of cooperation of the Arctic Programmes
Ms. Päivi Ekdahl (Development Director, Regional Council of Lapland) gave a short overview on the State of play of cooperation of the Arctic Programmes.

**Decision:**
Information was noted and discussed by the JMC.

6. The schedule of the 3rd Call for proposals
In the previous meeting in Oslo 08.–09.06.2017, the JMC approved the updated Programme documents, among them the Work Plan for 2017 – 2018. The JMC decided preliminarily that the 3rd call will be open from the beginning of April 2018 to the end of June 2018. As, according to the information received from the EC, it is unlikely that the additional allocation of ENI financing shall be received for 2018-2020, the MA proposes that the 3rd call is open from 2.5.2018 until 28.9.2018. The later timetable allows evaluation of the existing project envelope and the need for more focused call. In addition, later timetable allows clarification of the availability of additional ERDF funding and matching national co-financing.

**Decision:**
The JMC decided that the 3rd Call is open from 3.5.2018 until 28.9.2018. The JMC authorizes the MA to allocate the remaining financing to the 3rd call for proposals. If there will be some additional financing available from the ERDF, it will be allocated to the 4th call.

The JMC decided to have a meeting 24.04.2017 to approve the Application pack for 3rd Call for Proposals. The JMC recommends the MA to involve the RAGs to the updating of the evaluation grid.

7. Any other business
The MA asked the National Authorities to deliver the contact information of the Control Contact Points (CCP) latest by the next JMC.

8. Next meeting

**Decision:**
Next meeting will be held in Finland, on 24th April, 2018. Place will be confirmed later.

9. Closing of the meeting

**Decision:**
The Chairman closed the meeting at 14:15 Norwegian time.

Mr. Arve Skjerpen Ms. Marja-Riitta Lukkari
Chairman of the JMC Secretary of the JMC
### List of Annexes:

- **Annex 1**: JMC Rules of Procedure (RoP) including list of Members and Deputy members of the JMC
- **Annex 2**: Summary, administrative checklist and the full application of KO3000 General furnishing and surface infrastructure and surface infrastructure development of the Kola – Vehmetulomsky – BDP Lotta road
- **Annex 3**: Summary, administrative checklist and the full application of KO3001 Reconstruction of the road Kaamanen – Kirkenes
- **Annex 4**: Summary, administrative checklist and the full application of KO3002 Raja-Jooseppi BCP development and reconstruction; traffic arrangements, building and technology
- **Annex 5**: Summary of applications with MA’s comments of standard projects
- **Annex 6**: List of RAG scores 2nd Call for Proposals
- **Annex 7**: Evaluation Grid for RAGs 2nd Call for Proposals

### Presentations:

- **PP1**: Designation of the Managing Authority and the Description of the Management and Control system
- **PP2**: Participation in the annual CBC conference in Tallinn
- **PP3**: Presentation of Tesim
- **PP4**: Results of the 2nd Call for Proposals